2nd De Minimis settlement

### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT -FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF INDIANA FORT WAYNE DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  and  STATE OF INDIANA,  Plaintiffs  V.	) ) ) ) Civil Action No. ) HON. WILLIAM C. LEE
Defendants	) ) )

CONSENT DECREE

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	BACKGROUND	1
II.	EPA DETERMINATIONS	3
III.	JURISDICTION	5
IV.	PARTIES BOUND	5
v.	STATEMENT OF PURPOSE	6
vi.	DEFINITIONS	7
VII.	PAYMENT	10
VIII.	FAILURE TO MAKE PAYMENT	13
IX.	CERTIFICATION OF DE MINIMIS SETTLORS AND RD/RA SETTLORS	13
x.	COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY UNITED STATES	16
XI.	COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY STATE OF INDIANA	17
XII.	COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY DE MINIMIS SETTLORS AND INTERVENOR-PLAINTIFFS	19
XIII.	OTHER RESERVATIONS OF RIGHTS BY THE UNITED STATES AND THE STATE OF INDIANA	21
xiv.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION .	23
xv.	COMPLETE AGREEMENT/APPENDICES	24
XVI.	PUBLIC COMMENT	26
XVII.	EFFECTIVE DATE	27
XVIII.	SIGNATORIES/SERVICE	27
XIX.	RD/RA DECREE REMAINS IN EFFECT	28
xx.	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION; SATISFACTION	28
XXI.	COUNTERPARTS	29

### I. BACKGROUND

- On July 20, 1992, this Court entered a Consent Decree ("Active Products Consent Decree") resolving the civil actions filed as consolidated case numbers F91-00247 and F91-00281. United States and State of Indiana v. Active Products, et al.. Under that Decree and in return for various covenants not to sue from the United States, principally under Sections 106 and 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606 and 9607, twentyeight (28) settling defendants agreed, inter alia, to pay most of the United States' past response costs for the Wayne Reclamation & Recycling, Inc. Site (the "Facility"), located near Columbia City, Indiana, and to implement the remedy selected by the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") for the Facility. In addition, another one hundred and sixty (160) defendants, all determined to be de minimis under CERCLA Section 122(g), made payments to defray part of the cost of cleaning up the Facility, and also received certain covenants from the United States, principally under CERCLA Sections 106 and 107. The defendants who were party to the Active Products Consent Decree also resolved any contribution claims they may have had against each other.
- 2. The twenty-eight settling defendants (also known as the "RD/RA Settlors") who agreed to clean up the Facility under the Active Products Consent Decree have undertaken that work and have incurred response costs in doing so. On-site construction of the

remedial action components was completed in June, 1995.

Operation and maintenance of these systems has started and will continue.

3. Those RD/RA Settlors listed on Appendix A to this Consent Decree have identified other persons who may be liable for some share of the costs of cleaning up the Facility. These RD/RA Settlors based this identification upon documentary evidence not known to the United States or the RD/RA Settlors at the time of entry of the Active Products Consent Decree. In late May and early June of 1995, these RD/RA Settlors made written demands upon these other persons for payment, as well as upon previously identified persons who may be liable for cleanup costs at the Facility and who were not parties to the Active Products Consent Decree. On July 19, 1995, the RD/RA Settlors filed a CERCLA action in this Court against not less than approximately 1,181 defendants, seeking to recover sums that the RD/RA Settlors have spent and will spend in the course of performing response actions at the Facility under the Active Products Consent Decree. Active Products Corp., et al. v. A. H. Choitz & Co. Inc., et al. (Civil No. 1:95-CV-231). With the concurrence of the United States, the State of Indiana, and all De Minimis Settlors, each of whom is listed in Appendix B to this De Minimis Decree, the RD/RA Settlors also seek to join this CERCLA action filed by the United States and the action filed by the State of Indiana, as Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and, through the settlement of these actions under this consent decree ("the De

Minimis Decree"), these RD/RA Settlors (hereinafter, the "Intervenor-Plaintiffs") intend to resolve their CERCLA and certain other claims against all De Minimis Settlors.

- 4. The United States, the State of Indiana, the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors agree that settlement without further litigation and without the admission or adjudication of any issue of fact or law, except as provided in Sections I and III of this <u>De Minimis</u> Decree, is the most appropriate means of resolving this action with respect to the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors.
- 5. The Intervenor-Plaintiffs and <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors do not admit any liability to the United States or the State of Indiana, or to any other party to this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree, arising out of the transactions or occurrences alleged in the Complaint in this action.
- 6. The United States, the State of Indiana, the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors also all agree, and this Court finds by entering this Decree, that the settlement embodied herein is fair, reasonable, consistent with the statutory purposes of CERCLA, and in the public interest.

#### II. EPA DETERMINATIONS

7. The Superfund Division Director of EPA, Region 5 has determined, and the Indiana Department of Environmental Management has been apprised of, the following:

- a. prompt settlement with each Intervenor-Plaintiff and <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor is practicable and in the public interest within the meaning of Section 122(g)(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(g)(1);
- b. the payment to be made by each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor under this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree involves only a minor portion of the response costs at the Facility within the meaning of Section 122(g)(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(g)(1), based upon EPA's current estimate that the total response costs incurred and to be incurred by the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund, by the Indiana Hazardous Substance Response Trust Fund, and by potentially responsible parties at the Facility is approximately \$ 17.3 million; and
- the Facility by each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor and the toxic or other hazardous effects of the hazardous substances contributed to the Facility by each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor are minimal in comparison to other hazardous substances at the Facility pursuant to Section 122(g)(1)(A) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(g)(1)(A). This is because the amount of hazardous substances contributed to the Facility by each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor does not exceed 1% of the hazardous substances at the Facility, and the hazardous substances contributed by each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor to the Facility are not disproportionate in their toxic or other hazardous effects in comparison with the other hazardous substances disposed of at the Facility.

NOW, THEREFORE, it is ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

### III. JURISDICTION

8. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345 and 42 U.S.C. **§§** 9613(b) and 9622(g)(4). This Court also has personal jurisdiction over the De Minimis Settlors. The Complaints of the United States and the State of Indiana recite claims upon which relief may be granted. Solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree and the United States', the State of Indiana's, and the Intervenor-Plaintiffs' complaints against the De Minimis Settlors, the De Minimis Settlors and Intervenor-Plaintiffs waive all objections and defenses that they may have to jurisdiction of the Court or to venue in this District. The De Minimis Settlors and Intervenor-Plaintiffs shall not challenge the terms of this Consent Decree or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Decree, and the De Minimis Settlors and the Intervenor-Plaintiffs agree to entry of this Decree without further notice.

### IV. PARTIES BOUND

9. This Consent Decree shall apply to and be binding upon the United States and the State of Indiana, and shall apply to and be binding upon the Intervenor-Plaintiffs and the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors and their heirs, successors and assigns. Any change in ownership or corporate or other legal status of an Intervenor-Plaintiff or a <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor, including, but not limited to,

any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter such Intervenor-Plaintiff's or <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor's responsibilities under this Consent Decree.

### V. STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

- 10. By entering into this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree, the mutual objectives of the United States, the State of Indiana, the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors are:
- a. to reach with the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors a final settlement, as described in this <u>De Minimis</u> Decree, regarding the Facility pursuant to Section 122(g) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C.

  § 9622(g), that allows the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors to make a cash payment, including a premium, to resolve their alleged civil liability under Sections 106, 107, and 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C.

  §§ 9606, 9607 & 9613, and Section 7003 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, for injunctive relief with regard to the Facility and for response costs incurred and to be incurred at or in connection with the Facility, thereby avoiding difficult, prolonged, and complicated litigation among the Parties;
- b. to simplify any and all remaining administrative and judicial enforcement activities concerning the Facility by eliminating a substantial number of potentially responsible parties from further involvement at the Facility; and
- c. to obtain settlement with the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors for at least their fair share of response costs incurred and to be incurred at or in connection with the Facility by the EPA

Hazardous Substance Superfund, by the State of Indiana, and by private parties including the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, in exchange for full and complete contribution protection for the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors with regard to the Facility, as described in this <u>De Minimis</u> Decree, pursuant to Sections 113(f)(2) and 122(g)(5) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9613(f)(2) and 9622(g)(5).

### VI. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 11. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree that are defined in CERCLA or in regulations promulgated under CERCLA shall have the meaning assigned to them in the statute or regulations. Whenever the terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree, the following definitions shall apply:
- a. "CERCLA" shall mean the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, as amended, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9601, et seq.
- b. "Day" shall mean a calendar day. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or Federal holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.
- c. "De Minimis Consent Decree" or "Decree" shall mean this Consent Decree and all appendices attached hereto. In the event of conflict between this Consent Decree and any appendix, the Consent Decree shall control.

- d. "Active Products Consent Decree" shall mean the Consent Decree entered by this Court on July 20, 1992 in <u>United</u>

  States and State of Indiana v. Active Products, et al., Civ. Nos.

  F91-00247 and F91-00281.
- e. "De Minimis Settlors" or "Settling Defendants" shall mean the <u>de minimis</u> parties listed on Appendix B of this Decree.
- f. "EPA" shall mean the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any successor departments, agencies, or instrumentalities.
- g. "EPA Hazardous Substances Superfund" shall mean the Hazardous Substances Superfund established by the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507, and "Indiana Hazardous Substance Response Trust Fund" shall mean the fund established under Indiana Code 13-7-8.7-2.
- h. "Hazardous substance" shall have the meaning provided in Section 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14).
- I. "Interest" shall mean interest at the rate specified for interest on investments of the Hazardous Substance Superfund established under Subchapter A of Chapter 98 of Title 26 of the U.S. Code, compounded annually on October 1 of each year, in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a).
- j. "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by an arabic numeral.

- k. "Parties" shall mean the United States, the State of Indiana, the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and the <u>De Minimis</u>
  Settlors.
- l. "Intervenor-Plaintiffs" shall mean those parties listed on Appendix A to this Decree, the same parties who filed Civ. No. 1:95-C-0231 (A. H. Choitz Co., et al.) in this District ("A. H. Choitz action") or assigned their rights with respect to recoveries for clean up costs at the Facility and who are some of the RD/RA Settlors that agreed to clean up the Facility under the RD/RA Consent Decree.
- m. "Response costs" shall mean all costs of "response" as that term is defined by Section 101(25) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(25).
- n. "Facility" shall have the meaning as defined in Section 101(9) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(9), and refers to the location where hazardous substances have been deposited, stored, disposed of, treated or placed by Wayne Reclamation & Recycling, Inc. and other related entities, or otherwise came to be located, which facility is located within and near the city limits of Columbia City, Whitley County, State of Indiana, as generally shown on Appendix D to this Decree.
- o. "United States" shall mean the United States of America, including its agencies, departments, and instrumentalities.

- p. "RCRA" shall mean the Solid Waste Disposal Act, as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 6901 et seg. (also known as the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act).
- q. "State of Indiana" shall mean the State of Indiana and all of its Agencies and branches, including the Indiana

  Department of Environmental Management and the State of Indiana's Natural Resource Trustees.

### VII. PAYMENT

Appendix B to the Wayne Reclamation & Recycling RD/RA Settlors
Trust Fund (hereinafter "Trust Fund"), each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor
shall pay that sum within thirty (30) days after entry of this <u>De Minimis</u> Decree, provided, however that where Appendix C of this
<u>De Minimis</u> Decree provides a specific <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor with
more than thirty days to pay, such schedule shall dictate the
time and manner of payment to the Trust Fund. The payment(s)
shall be delivered to Bill Hall or John Fehrenbach of Winston &
Strawn in the form of a certified or cashier check payable to
"Wayne Reclamation and Recycling RD/RA Settlors Trust Fund" and
shall reference the name, address, and defendant number in the <u>A.</u>
H. Choitz action.

Each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor's payment includes an amount for: a) natural resource damage claims; b) past response costs at or in connection with the Facility; c) projected future response costs to be incurred at or in connection with the Facility; and

- d) a premium to cover the time value of money and the risks associated with this <u>de minimis</u> settlement, including but not limited to, the risk that total response costs incurred and to be incurred at the Facility by the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund, or by any potentially responsible party at the Facility who is not a <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor, will exceed the estimated total response costs upon which <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors' payments are based, either because the selected remedy is more expensive than expected or because of remedy failure or because of the need to perform additional work under the <u>Active Products</u> Consent Decree to assure the adequate protection of public health and the environment.
- 13. Within forty (40) days of entry of this Decree, the Trust Fund shall pay to the United States and the State of Indiana the following sums, in the manner specified below:
- a. \$166,240 to the EPA Hazardous Substances
  Superfund, delivered to the EPA, Superfund Accounting, P.O. Box
  70753, Chicago, Illinois 60673 in the form of a certified or
  cashier check payable to "EPA Hazardous Substances Superfund".
  The check, or a transmittal accompanying the check, shall
  reference the name and address of the party making payment, the
  Facility name, EPA CERCLA Number IND 95, and DOJ Case Number
  90-11-3-603;
- b. \$24,000 to the Office of the Secretary of the Interior for damage to natural resources at the Facility.

  Payment shall be made as directed by the United States, upon

entry of this Decree. The payment should reference the Facility name and the Consent Decree to which it pertains.

- c. \$12,826.17 to the Indiana Hazardous Substance
  Response Trust Fund, delivered to the Indiana Department of
  Environmental Management, 100 North Senate Avenue, P.O. Box 6015,
  Indiana Government Center North, Indianapolis, Indiana 46206,
  Attn: Bob Schaible, Project Manager. Payment shall be in the
  form of a certified or cashier check payable to "Indiana
  Hazardous Substance Response Trust Fund". The check, or a
  transmittal accompanying the check, shall reference the name and
  address of the party making payment and the Facility name.
- 14. At the time of each payment by the IntervenorPlaintiffs under Section VII of this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree,
  the Intervenor-Plaintiffs shall send a copy of all payment
  transmittal documentation to:

Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section United States Department of Justice DJ No. 90-11-3-603 P.O. Box 7611 Washington, D.C. 20044

Kevin C. Chow Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel U.S. EPA, Region 5 (C-29A) 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604 Bob Schaible
Project Manager
Indiana Department of Environmental Management
100 North Senate Avenue
P.O. Box 6015
Indiana Government Center North
Indianapolis, Indiana 46206

### VIII. FAILURE TO MAKE PAYMENTS TO THE UNITED STATES

15. If the Intervenor-Plaintiffs fail to make full payment within the time required by Paragraph 13, they shall pay Interest on the unpaid balance. Nothing in this provision alters the right of the United States or the State of Indiana to take any available action against the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, including the right of the United States to bring an action against the Intervenor-Plaintiffs to seek injunctive relief to compel payment and/or seek civil penalties under Section 122(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. 9622(1), for failure to make timely payment.

### IX. CERTIFICATION OF DE MINIMIS SETTLORS AND RD/RA SETTLORS

- 16. <u>De Minimis Settlors</u>. By signing this Consent Decree, each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor certifies, individually, that, to the best of its knowledge and belief, the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor has:
- a. Received from the Intervenor-Plaintiffs copies of invoices or other documents purporting to demonstrate that the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor arranged for the disposal of hazardous substances at the Facility;
- b. Conducted a reasonable, good faith search and inquiry for documents other than those received from the

Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and has fully and accurately disclosed to EPA or to the Intervenor-Plaintiffs all additional information, currently in the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor's possession, or in the possession of its officers, directors, employees, contractors or agents, which relates in any way to the ownership, operation, or control of the Facility, or to the ownership, possession, generation, treatment, transportation, storage or disposal of a hazardous substance, pollutant, contaminant, or waste material at or in connection with the Facility; provided, however, that each De Minimis Settlor may withhold any document protected by the attorney-client or attorney work product privileges so long as the De Minimis Settlor has disclosed the information contained in such document that relates to any alleged generation, treatment, transportation, storage, or disposal of a hazardous substance, pollutant, contaminant, or waste material at or in connection with the Facility;

- c. No information or documents, and is unaware of any information or documents, which purport to indicate that the hazardous substances, pollutants, contaminants, or other waste materials picked up by Wayne Reclamation and Recycling, Inc. from the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor's operation(s), or which otherwise were allegedly sent to the Facility, were greater in amount than or different in nature from the waste amount or nature of waste set forth for that <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor in Appendix B; and
- d. Not altered, mutilated, discarded, destroyed or otherwise disposed of any records, documents, or other

information relating to <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor's potential liability regarding the Facility after notification of potential liability or the filing of a suit against <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor regarding the Facility.

- 17. <u>Intervenor-Plaintiffs</u>. By signing this Consent Decree, each Intervenor-Plaintiff certifies, individually, that to the best of its knowledge and belief the Intervenor-Plaintiff has:
- a. in estimating for settlement purposes the amount of waste to be assigned to each potentially responsible party, including each Intervenor-Plaintiff, for clean up of the Facility, the Intervenor-Plaintiff used its best efforts to collect and tally such information accurately, fairly, and without bias against any person or group or class of persons;
- b. fully and fairly examined each written grievance or challenge presented to the Intervenor-Plaintiffs in connection with the manner in which the Intervenor-Plaintiffs calculated for settlement purposes the portion of waste allegedly attributable to each person with whom the Intervenor-Plaintiffs offered a settlement;
- c. answered completely and honestly all questions presented to the Intervenor-Plaintiffs by the United States on or after March 15, 1995 in the course of EPA's gathering information about the propriety and the fairness of the settlement embodied in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree; and
- d. made available for inspection by the United States all non-privileged documents used by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs in

calculating the settlement offers made by the IntervenorPlaintiffs to those named as defendants in the A. H. Choitz
action and to those De Minimis Settlers who settled prior to the
filing of the A. H. Choitz action; and

e. certified that the total costs expended and to be incurred at the Facility and for the ultimate completion of remedial design and remedial action at the Facility have been fairly and reasonably estimated by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs to total not less than approximately \$17.3 million, \$3.9 million of which represents estimated costs associated with the annual operation, maintenance, and oversight of the remedy during the period subsequent to May, 1995.

### I. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY UNITED STATES

and are to be made by the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors in satisfaction of the claims of the United States under the terms of this Consent Decree, and except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 23 and 24, the United States covenants not to sue or take administrative action against any of the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors pursuant to Sections 106 or 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606 or 9607, and Section 7003 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, relating to the Facility. With respect to alleged present and future liability, this covenant not to sue shall take effect with respect to each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor upon the receipt by the United States of the Trust Fund payments required by Paragraph 13 of this Consent

Decree. With respect to each De Minimis Settlor, individually, this covenant not to sue is conditioned upon: a) the complete and satisfactory performance by the De Minimis Settlor of all obligations under this Consent Decree including payment obligations under Paragraph 12 and, if applicable, Appendix C; and b) the veracity and completeness of the information provided to EPA and/or the Intervenor-Plaintiffs by the De Minimis Settlor relating to the De Minimis Settlor's alleged involvement with the Facility pursuant to Paragraph 16(a) through (d) of this De Minimis Decree. This covenant not to sue shall be null and void with respect to any individual De Minimis Settlor that: a) fails to perform all obligations under this Consent Decree (including all payment obligations under Paragraph 12 and, if applicable, Appendix C) in a complete and satisfactory manner; or b) has provided materially false, incomplete, or incorrect information pursuant to the Certification of De Minimis Settlors under Paragraph 16. This covenant not to sue extends only to the De Minimis Settlors and does not extend to any other person.

### XI. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY STATE OF INDIANA

and are to be made by the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors in satisfaction of the claims of the State of Indiana under the terms of this Consent Decree, and except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 23 and 24, the State of Indiana covenants not to sue or take administrative action against any of the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors

pursuant to CERCLA, RCRA, Indiana Code 13-7-8.7, and common law nuisance, relating to the Facility. With respect to alleged present and future liability, this covenant not to sue shall take effect with respect to each De Minimis Settlor upon the receipt by the State of Indiana of the Trust Fund payment required by Paragraph 13 of this Consent Decree. With respect to each De Minimis Settlor, individually, this covenant not to sue is conditioned upon: a) the complete and satisfactory performance by the De Minimis Settlor of all obligations under this Consent Decree including payment obligations under Paragraph 12 and, if applicable, Appendix C; and b) the veracity and completeness of the information provided to EPA and/or the Intervenor-Plaintiffs by the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor relating to the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor's alleged involvement with the Facility pursuant to Paragraph 16(a) through (d) of this De Minimis Decree. This covenant not to sue shall be null and void with respect to any individual De Minimis Settlor that: a) fails to perform all obligations under this Consent Decree (including all payment obligations under Paragraph 12 and, if applicable, Appendix C) in a complete and satisfactory manner; or b) has provided materially false, incomplete, or incorrect information pursuant to the Certification of De Minimis Settlors under Paragraph 16. This covenant not to sue extends only to the De Minimis Settlors and does not extend to any other person.

# XII. COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY DE MINIMIS SETTLORS AND INTERVENOR-PLAINTIFFS

- 20. The <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors covenant not to sue and agree not to assert any claims or causes of action against the United States, the State of Indiana, or their contractors or employees with respect to the Facility or this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement from the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund (established pursuant to the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507) through Sections 106(b)(2), 107, 111, 112, or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606(b)(2), 9607, 9611, 9612, or 9613, or any other provision of law, or any claims arising out of response activities at the Facility. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to constitute preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. § 300.700(d).
- 21. The <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors covenant not to sue and agree not to assert any claims or causes of action against each other with regard to the Facility pursuant to Sections 107 or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613, Section 7003 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, Indiana Code 13-7-8.7, and common law nuisance. The <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors also covenant not to sue and agree not to assert any claims or causes of action against the Intervenor-Plaintiffs pursuant to, and as provided in, the Release and Settlement Agreement entered into by each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor and the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, models of which are attached hereto as Appendices F and G. The <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors further covenant not

to sue any other person under CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601 et seq., Section 7003 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, Indiana Code 13-7-8.7, and common law nuisance for any matter related to this Facility.

- 22. The Intervenor-Plaintiffs covenant not to sue and agree not to assert any claims or causes of action against each <u>De</u>

  <u>Minimis</u> Settlor as provided in the Release and Settlement

  Agreement entered into by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs and such <u>De</u>

  <u>Minimis</u> Settlor, models of which are attached hereto as

  Appendices F and G. The Intervenor-Plaintiffs also covenant not to sue any other person who may be liable under CERCLA for arranging for the disposal of hazardous substances placed at the Facility other than those named as defendants in the <u>A. H. Choitz</u> action, provided, however, that nothing in this Paragraph 22 shall bar the Intervenor-Plaintiffs from any of the following:
- a. filing any motion seeking leave to amend the A. H. Choitz Complaint on or before December 31, 1996 for the purpose of correcting the Complaint to name a party the Intervenor-Plaintiffs attempted to name in the original complaint but did not correctly identify owing to inadvertence or lack of information needed to identify the party correctly in the first instance, or to name a party based upon allegations of dissolution, fraudulent transfer of a named party's assets, or other successorship of legal responsibility from a party already named to another person.
- b. filing any motion in the <u>A. H. Choitz</u> action under Rule
   25, Fed. R. Civ. P.;

- c. filing a CERCLA claim against any person for recovery of costs incurred in connection with the Facility if and only if, on or before July 20, 1995, the RD/RA Settlors should not have had any reason to know that such person may have been a customer of Wayne Reclamation and Recycling, Inc.;
- d. filing a claim for failure to meet a requirement of this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree; and
- e. filing a claim for liability to the IntervenorPlaintiffs for arranging for disposal or treatment of hazardous substances at the Facility by or on behalf of a <u>De Minimis</u>
  Settlor where such arrangement for disposal or treatment takes place after the date of lodging of this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree and where such disposal or treatment was not required by the Facility clean up being carried out by the RD/RA Settlors under the <u>Active Products</u> Consent Decree.

## XIII. OTHER RESERVATIONS OF RIGHTS BY THE UNITED STATES AND THE STATE OF INDIANA

- 23. The covenants not to sue by the United States and the State of Indiana set forth in Paragraphs 18 and 19 do not pertain to any matters other than those expressly specified in Paragraphs 18 and 19. The United States and the State of Indiana reserve, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights against the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors with respect to all other matters, including but not limited to the following:
- a. liability for failure to meet a requirement of this

  De Minimis Consent Decree;

- b. criminal liability; and
- c. liability for arranging for disposal or treatment of hazardous substances at the Facility by or on behalf of a <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor where such future arrangement for disposal or treatment takes place after the date of lodging of this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree and where such disposal or treatment was not required by the Facility clean up being carried out by the RD/RA Settlors under the <u>Active Products</u> Consent Decree.
- Notwithstanding any other provision in this De Minimis Consent Decree, the United States and the State of Indiana reserve, and this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings against any individual De Minimis Settlor in this action or in a new action or to issue an administrative order to any individual De Minimis Settlor seeking to compel that De Minimis Settlor to perform response actions relating to the Facility, or to reimburse the United States or the State of Indiana for additional costs of response, if any individual De Minimis Settlor -- after signing this Consent Decree -- becomes an owner or operator of the Facility or undertakes any activity with regard to hazardous substances at the Facility; or if information is discovered which indicates that the De Minimis Settlor contributed hazardous substances to the Facility in such greater amount or of such greater toxic or other hazardous effects that such De Minimis Settlor no longer qualifies as a de minimis party at the Facility because of

-22-

failure to meet the toxicity or amount limit set out in Paragraph
7(c) as the qualifying de minimis determination.

### XIV. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

- 25. Nothing in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree shall be construed to create any rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any person not a party to this Consent Decree. The preceding sentence shall not be construed to waive or nullify any rights that any person not a signatory to this Consent Decree may have under applicable law. Except as otherwise specified in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree or the <u>Active Products</u> Consent Decree, the United States, the State of Indiana, the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors each reserve any and all rights, defenses, claims, demands, and causes of action which each party may have with respect to any matter, transaction, or occurrence relating in any way to the Facility.
- 26. The United States, the State of Indiana, the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors agree that the actions undertaken by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs and the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors in accordance with this Consent Decree do not constitute an admission of any liability by any party.
- 27. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States or the State of Indiana for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other appropriate relief relating to the Facility, no Intervenor-Plaintiff or <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor shall assert or maintain any

defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, <u>res</u>
<u>judicata</u>, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting,
or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims
raised in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been
brought in the instant action; provided, however, that nothing in
this Paragraph 27 affects the enforceability of the covenants not
to sue included in Paragraphs 18 and 19 of this <u>De Minimis</u>
Consent Decree or in Paragraph 78 of the <u>Active Products</u> Consent
Decree.

Minimis Settlor, the Parties hereto agree that each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor is entitled, as of the date of entry of this Consent Decree, to protection from contribution actions or claims as provided by Sections 113(f)(2) and 122(g)(5) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. \$\$ 9613(f)(2) and 9622(g)(5), for matters addressed in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree. The matters addressed in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree are all response actions taken and to be taken by the United States, the State of Indiana, and the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and all response costs incurred and to be incurred, by the United States, the State of Indiana, or by private parties, including the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, at or in connection with the Pacility.

#### XV. COMPLETE AGREEMENT/APPENDICES

29. This <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree and its appendices constitute the final, complete, and exclusive agreement and

understanding among the Parties with respect to the settlement embodied in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree. The Parties acknowledge that there are no representations, agreements or understandings relating to the settlement other than those expressly contained in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree, except the Release and Settlement Agreement which has been entered into by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs and each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor. The following appendices are attached to and incorporated into this Consent Decree:

"Appendix A" is the list of Intervenor-Plaintiffs
participating in the A. H. Choitz action and this Consent Decree.

"Appendix B" is the list of <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors who are signatories to this Consent Decree, the waste amount alleged for each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor, and the amount paid or to be paid by each.

"Appendix C" is the payment schedule for certain <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors.

"Appendix D" is a map of the Facility.

"Appendix E" is a summary explanation of the formula used in determining the amounts demanded of the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs.

"Appendices F and G" are models of the Release and Settlement Agreement entered into by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs and De Minimis Settlors.

### XVI. PUBLIC COMMENT

- The Parties agree and acknowledge that final approval by the United States and entry of this Consent Decree are subject to the public notice and comment provisions of Section 122(d)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(d)(2), and 28 C.F.R. § 50.7, as well as any public comment received through any public meeting held under RCRA Section 7003(d), 42 U.S.C. § 6073(d). In accordance with those provisions, a notice of the lodging of the proposed settlement shall be published in the Federal Register after the De Minimis Consent Decree is lodged with the Court. Members of the public shall be provided at least thirty (30) days after publication of that notice to inform the U.S. Department of Justice of any comments concerning the proposed settlement, and the U.S. Department of Justice shall receive and consider, and after concluding such consideration, shall file with the Court any written comments, views or allegations relating to the proposed settlement.
- 31. The Parties agree and acknowledge that the United States and the State of Indiana each reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent to this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree if the comments regarding the <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations which indicate that the Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper or inadequate. The Intervenor-Plaintiffs and <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors consent to entry of this Consent Decree without further notice, and the United States, the State of Indiana, and Intervenor-Plaintiffs reserve the right to

oppose an attempt by any other person to intervene in this civil action.

### XVII. EFFECTIVE DATE

32. The effective date of this Consent Decree shall be the date of entry by this Court, following public comment pursuant to Paragraphs 30 and 31.

### XVIII. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE

- 33. Each undersigned representative of a <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor or Intervenor-Plaintiff who is a party to this Consent Decree, the undersigned representative of the Environment and Natural Resources Division of the U.S. Department of Justice, and the Deputy Attorney General for the State of Indiana on behalf of the Governor of Indiana, certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind such party to this document.
- 34. Each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor and Intervenor-Plaintiff hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree, unless the United States or the State of Indiana has notified the <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors and Intervenor-Plaintiffs in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.
- 35. Each <u>De Minimis</u> Settlor shall identify, on the attached signature page, the name and address of an agent who is authorized to accept service of process by mail on behalf of that

party with respect to all matters arising under or relating to this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree. The <u>De Minimis</u> Settlors hereby agree to accept service in that manner and to waive the formal service requirements set forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local rules of this Court, including but not limited to, service of a summons.

### XIX. RD/RA DECREE REMAINS IN EFFECT

36. The 1992 Active Products Consent Decree remains in full force and effect, except to the extent that covenants made in this <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree by the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, the United States, and the State of Indiana resolve claims or portions of claims that were reserved under the 1992 Active Products Consent Decree.

### XX. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION: SATISFACTION

- 37. The Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter and the parties for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree, and to resolve any disputes that may arise regarding the construction or implementation of this Consent Decree.
- 38. Upon each receiving the timely payments of the amount due them under Section VII of this Consent Decree, the United States and the State of Indiana each shall file a Notice with the Court, stating that such payments have been received.

### XXI. COUNTERPARTS

39. This <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree may be executed in any number of counterparts, each of which when executed and delivered to EPA shall be deemed to be an original, but each such counterpart shall together constitute one and the same document.

80	ORDERED	THIS		DAY	OF		
			i				
						Villiam C. Lee	
					1	Inited States District Jul	300

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES, by signing this Signature Page, hereby consent to abide by and be bound to all the terms, conditions, and requirements set forth in the foregoing <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree relating to the Wayne Reclamation and Recycling, Inc. Site, Columbia City, Indiana.

FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Date:	

Environment and Natural Resources
Division
U.S. Department of Justice

Thomas A. Mariani, Jr.
Environmental Enforcement Section
Environment and Natural Resources
Division
U.S. Department of Justice
P.O. Box 7611
Washington, D.C. 20044-7611

William E. Muno
Director, Superfund Division
U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency, Region 5
77 West Jackson Boulevard
Chicago, Illinois 60604

Kevin C. Chow
Assistant Regional Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency, Region 5
77 West Jackson Boulevard
Chicago, Illinois 60604

## FOR THE STATE OF INDIANA

Date:	
	Michael O'Connor Commissioner
	Indiana Department of Environmental Management 100 North Senate Avenue
	Post Office Box 6015
	Indianapolis, Indiana 46206-6015
	OFFICE OF THE GOVERNOR
Date:	By:
	APPROVED AS TO LEGALITY AND FORM
	Pamela Carter
	Attorney General of Indiana
Date:	By:
	Myra Spicker Deputy Attorney General

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY, by signing this Signature Page, hereby consents to abide by and be bound to all the terms, conditions, and requirements set forth in the foregoing <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree relating to the Wayne Reclamation and Recycling, Inc. Site, Columbia City, Indiana.

FOR	DEFENDANT	[Name and [	***************************************		
		A. H. Choit			
			······································		
		[Address]			
		[Phone Numb	per]		
	·	[FAX Number	]		
Date:			By:	[Signature]	***************************************
				(Signature)	
				[Name, Type	or Print]
Ager Party:	nt Authoriz	ed to Accept	: Service	on Behalf of	Above-signed
	Name:			Manufacture and the second sec	
	Title:			The state of the s	
	Address:	-		<del></del>	

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY, by signing this Signature Page, hereby consents to abide by and be bound to all the terms, conditions, and requirements set forth in the foregoing <u>De Minimis</u> Consent Decree relating to the Wayne Reclamation and Recycling, Inc. Site, Columbia City, Indiana.

	FOR	INTERVENOR-	PLAINTIFF	[Name]	
				[Address]	
				[Phone Nu	mber]
				[FAX Number	er]
Date:			_	ву:	[Signature]
					[Name, Type or Print]
Party		nt Authorize	d to Accep	ot Service	on Behalf of Above-signed
		Name:			
		Title:			·
		Address:			