

**RESTORATION COMPLETION REPORT**

**ASHTABULA RIVER AREA  
NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGES**

**ASHTABULA, OHIO**

**PREPARED BY**

*de maximis, inc.*

*(April 29, 2016)*  
*(Project #204-001520-002)*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>SECTION/TITLE</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
1.0 INTRODUCTION	1
2.0 BACKGROUND	1 - 2
3.0 PHYSICAL SETTING	2
4.0 ASHTABULA TOWNSHIP PARKS COMMISSION PROPERTY	2 - 6
4.1 Location & Description	2 - 3
4.2 Primary Restoration Activities	3 - 4
4.3 Secondary Restoration Activities	4 - 5
4.4 Current Conditions	5 - 6
4.5 Cost	6
5.0 BUSH, CAYLOR, GUARRACINO, KIGHTLINGER & SHINER PROPERTIES	6 - 10
5.1 Acquisition & Transfer	6 - 7
5.2 Location & Description	7 - 8
5.3 Restoration Activities & Current Conditions	8 - 9
5.4 Cost	9 - 10
6.0 RICHARDSON PROPERTY	10 - 11
6.1 Acquisition & Transfer	10
6.2 Location & Description	10
6.3 Restoration Activities & Current Conditions	10
6.4 Cost	11
7.0 FINAL STATEMENT OF COMPLETION OF WORK	11
8.0 FINAL STATEMENT OF QUALIFIED COSTS	11
9.0 PROJECT COORDINATOR'S STATEMENT	11

## FIGURES

Figure 1	Ashtabula County Restoration Properties
Figure 2	Ashtabula Township Park Commission Property
Figure 3	2013 Restoration Planting Plan
Figure 4	2014 Restoration Planting Plan
Figure 5	Robert & Lallita Bush Property
Figure 6	Richard & Eva Caylor Property
Figure 7	Mario & Patricia Guarracino Property
Figure 8	Walter & Katherine Kightlinger Property
Figure 9	Allen & Alice Shiner Property
Figure 10	Richard Richardson Property

## ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A	Photos
Attachment B	Permits
Attachment C	Water Level Control, Canoe Launch & Parking Lot Design
Attachment D	Boardwalk Design
Attachment E	Project Field Reports
Attachment F	Final Detailed Statement of Qualified Costs

## REFERENCES

“The Consent Decree Regarding Ashtabula River Area Natural Resource Damages” (United States of America v Cabot Corporation, et al.) and Appendix D (“Scope of Work”) and Appendix E (“Environmental Covenant Template”) as filed in the United States District Court for the Northern District of Ohio Eastern Division.

September 14, 2009 “Final Natural Resource Restoration Plan & Environmental Assessment for the Ashtabula River and Harbor Site”

April, 2003 “Indian Trails Master Plan – Study Report”

2006 “Cooperative Agreement between the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service and the Ashtabula Township Parks Commission”

June, 2006 “Environmental Covenant” for the subject property

November 6, 2006 “BBL Memorandum from Steven Perry to Joseph Heimbuch”

January 24, 2007 “Arcadis Memorandum from Steven Perry to Joseph Heimbuch”

January 29, 2007 “Arcadis Memorandum from Steven Perry to Joseph Heimbuch”

2008 “Summary Appraisal Report of the Bush Property” – Paul O. VanCuren

2008 “Summary Appraisal Report of the Kightlinger Property” – Paul O. VanCuren

2008 “Summary Appraisal Report of the Shiner Properties” – Paul O. VanCuren

March 2011 “Guidelines for Wetland Mitigation Banking in Ohio”

March 2012 “Site Guidance Notes from Joe Loucek of Ohio EPA

September 28, 2012 “Final Work Plan for Preservation/Protection/Restoration of the Ashtabula Township Parks Commission Property”

October 9, 2012 “Final Combined Work Plan for Preservation/Protection/Restoration of the Bush, Caylor, Guarracino, Kightlinger & Shiner Properties”

June 12, 2013 “Field Inspection Reports for the Bush, Caylor, Guarracino, Kightlinger & Shiner Properties”

2013 “Summary Appraisal Report of the Richardson Property” – Paul O. Van Curen

March 2014 “Survey & Legal Description of Richardson Property” – Jerry Slay

2014 “Ashtabula Trustee Council Resolution #7

2012 – 2015 Monthly Progress Memoranda (#1 through #43)

2013 – 2014 Status Teleconferences

July 7, 2015 “Final Work Plan for Preservation/Protection/Restoration of the Richardson Property

## 1.0 **INTRODUCTION**

This Restoration Completion Report ("Completion Report") is prepared in accordance with Section VI, Paragraph 22 of the "The Consent Decree Regarding Ashtabula River Area Natural Resource Damages" (United States of America v Cabot Corporation, et al. – Case Number 1:12CV01091) ("Consent Decree"). The Completion Report includes:

- A description of all activities performed by the Ashtabula River Cooperating Group II ("ARCG II");
- A statement affirming that all activities were performed in accordance with approved work plans and/or Trustee resolutions or directives;
- A final accounting of all "Qualified Costs" as defined in Section IV, Paragraph 4 (y) of the Consent Decree; and
- A statement by the ARCG II's Project Coordinator that information contained in the Completion Report is "true, accurate and complete".

## 2.0 **BACKGROUND**

The Ashtabula River is located in northeast Ohio, flowing in a northwesterly direction to its confluence with Lake Erie at the City of Ashtabula. The drainage basin covers approximately 137 square miles. The City of Ashtabula is the only significant urban center in the watershed. The balance of the drainage basin is primarily rural and agricultural. There is concentrated industrial development around Fields Brook and to the east of the mouth of the Ashtabula River.

In 1994, as an alternative to the designation of the Ashtabula River as an operable unit of the Fields Brook Superfund Site, the Ashtabula River Partnership ("ARP") was formed to facilitate a cleanup of the Ashtabula River. ARP members included: U.S. Army Corps of Engineers ("USACE"); U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("USEPA"); U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service ("USFWS"); Ohio Environmental Protection Agency ("Ohio EPA"); City of Ashtabula; local industries; and private citizens. The ARCG II was also a member of the ARP.

Contaminated sediments were dredged from the Ashtabula River from 2006 to 2008 using funds provided by the ARCG II, USEPA (Great Lakes Legacy Act), State of Ohio and the USACE (Water Resources Development Act). The contaminated sediments were placed into a TSCA-permitted landfill located in the industrial area east of the Ashtabula River.

The ARCG II and the Trustees agreed to settle natural resource damage claims in 2008 and the terms of that settlement are embodied in the Consent Decree. There are three (3) general preservation and restoration elements of the settlement:

- (1) The design and implementation of restoration activities at the Ashtabula Township Parks Commission (ATPC) Property (formerly - and also - known as the "Brockway Property" and the "CDM Property"). This property was acquired in 2006 prior to the settlement of natural resource damage claims for the Ashtabula River. The funds for the purchase were provided through a cooperative agreement with USFWS as directed by a resolution of the Ashtabula Trustee Council.

- (2) The acquisition of certain properties designated by the Trustees within the Ashtabula River watershed. These properties were initially acquired by *de maximis, inc.* (“*de maximis*”) on behalf of the ARCG II. The acquired properties were transferred from *de maximis* to an “Acceptable Entity” identified by the Trustees. These properties were evaluated for restoration activities.
- (3) The possible acquisition of “additional restoration properties” led to the purchase by *de maximis* of approximately 140 acres of undeveloped property owned by the Richardson family. This property was also transferred from *de maximis* to an “Acceptable Entity” identified by the Trustees.

The location of all properties and their relative proximity to each other are presented in Figure 1.

During the course of this project, Trustee and ARCG II representatives had routine teleconferences in order to maintain open lines of communication as to various aspects of the project and to expedite the decision-making process. In addition, written Progress Memoranda were issued on a monthly basis providing an overview of activities and expenditures.

### **3.0 PHYSICAL SETTING**

The lower Ashtabula River is an urbanized system. The shoreline is highly developed, channelized, hardened and industrialized. However, the Ashtabula River above the 2.0 river mile – to river mile 27.54 – is classified as superior high quality waters (Rule 3745-1-05, Ohio Administrative Code). Superior high quality waters are defined as surface waters that possess exceptional ecological values and that have been so categorized pursuant to Paragraph E of the aforementioned rule. All of the subject properties referenced in the report are within this superior high quality reach (Figure 1).

### **4.0 ASHTABULA TOWNSHIP PARKS COMMISSION (ATPC) PROPERTY**

#### **4.1 Location & Description**

*The ATPC Property* is within the Ashtabula River riparian ecosystem and connected by an extensive corridor of green space within or near the Indian Trails Park. The ATPC Property is located adjacent to Cederquist Park and Indian Trails Park and serves as a link in the Ashtabula River’s continuous riparian corridor. The ATPC owns this property. There is an Environmental Covenant filed of record for the property between the ATPC and USFWS and Ohio EPA. The provisions of the Environmental Covenant generally mandate that “the property shall be kept in its natural state, i.e., no buildings, billboards or other structures of any kind, either temporary or permanent, shall be placed or erected on the property, unless otherwise expressly provided hereunder”. The Environmental Covenant is binding upon the ATPC and any successors in interest and “shall run with the land” pursuant to Ohio Revised Code, Section 5301.85.

The ATPC Property (pre-restoration) was vacant and wooded with limited ecological or habitat value, especially in relationship to its location within a



“superior high quality” reach of the Ashtabula River. Except for some footpaths; a crude parking area (likely established by anglers); and electricity transmission lines there was no evidence of development or infrastructure.

The ATPC Property is 37.27 acres in size. The “Aerial View of the ATPC Property” (Figure 2) indicates that the majority of the 37.27 acres is floodplain with wetland, pond and woodland habitats. On the eastern side of the property there is a steep escarpment below Harbor Avenue. A portion of the western side of the parcel is within the FEMA 100 year floodplain. The remainder of the property between the river and escarpment exhibits riparian floodplain characteristics with a variety of habitats, including pond, wetland, woodland, meadow and small vernal pools. It appeared that the water in the pond at the north end of the property and in the small vernal pools at the base of the escarpment most often originates on the upland (eastern) side of the parcel that runs from the floodplain up the hill toward Harbor Avenue. Other than during greater than 100 year interval floods or perhaps during spring high flows when ice reportedly jams up against the 24<sup>th</sup> Street Bridge, the pond water is supplied by a combination of direct precipitation, surface flow from the upland stream and/or the underlying water table – which is perched on shale bedrock and overlain with silty loam soils.

The property was used for fishing access to the Ashtabula River, with well-worn paths evident along the waterfront. Access was gained via a driveway from 24<sup>th</sup> Street into a small, crude, gravel parking lot which was perched on a slope leading down to the rest of the property.

#### **4.2 Primary Restoration Activities**

The details of the restoration activities planned for the ATPC Property are presented in the “Work Plan for Preservation/Protection/Restoration of Ashtabula Township Parks Commission Property” dated September 28, 2012.

The primary objectives of the ATPC Restoration were directed at establishing and enhancing a diverse, high-value native wetland, plant and tree habitat along with modernizing the existing weir system to better control the water level in the wetland to encourage growth of the amphibian population while restricting fish access. (Photos are provided in Attachment A.)

- Plantings - The wetland area, initially filled with reed canary grass, was cut down to control this invasive species. A planting plan (Figure 3) was developed following guidelines provided by Ohio Department of Natural Resources. Three (3) acres of wetland were planted with 400 wetland bushes per acre and two (2) additional acres of forested area were planted with 200 bushes and 200 trees per acre. All tree trunks were wrapped to restrict wildlife from damaging the trees and staked for support. Approximately one acre was not planted with new trees and bushes because of a 110 foot power line easement that transects the northwestern



property line. Following the winter of 2013/2014, an inspection was undertaken to determine the condition of the plantings. Results of this inspection are reported in Section 4.4.

- Water Level Control - An existing weir and pipeline connecting the wetland to the river was replaced. The weir height will be controlled to maintain appropriate seasonal water levels in the wetland. Seasonal adjustments of the water level in the wetland will encourage a healthy amphibian population and restrict fish from populating the wetland. A USACE Nationwide Permit was required for this work. (A copy of the permit is provided in Attachment B and the weir design information is provided in Attachment C.)

#### **4.3 Secondary Restoration Activities**

Because of the property's close proximity to a popular recreational area, the restoration program was expanded to upgrade human use services so the public could enjoy the dynamics of this high valued habitat area. Human use enhancements included: (1) upgrading and adding pathways/trails; (2) development of a canoe launch area; (3) construction of a boardwalk and viewing area; (4) posting of informational signage; and (5) upgrading the parking area.

- Upgraded and Additional Pathways/Trails - The existing pathway (Figure 2) was widened to three (3) feet wide and covered with woodchips provided by ATPC. An additional pathway was cleared to the southern edge of the wetland to provide more controlled exploration of the property and a view from the opposite side. Both trails end in a circular area large enough for relaxing and enjoying the view from the water's edge. Both pathways, totaling 3,320 feet, are covered with woodchips, except for the length between the parking area and the boardwalk entrance, which is covered in crushed stone.
- Inlet Access and Canoe Launch - On the north end of the property, a short pathway from the parking area provides access to the existing inlet at which a modest canoe launch was constructed. Piers and/or decking were not used due to the ice dams that form every winter. A USACE Nationwide Permit was required for this work. (A copy of the permit is provided in Attachment B and canoe launch design information is provided in Attachment C.)
- Boardwalk and Viewing Area - A raised boardwalk was constructed on the north side of the wetland and extended to an observation deck (16 feet by 16 feet) at the center of the wetland. From the observation deck, the boardwalk turns west and continues to the vicinity of the walking path along the river. The observation deck has benches for seating on two sides. The boardwalk's decking, seating and railings are constructed of recycled materials. "Eco-Life" treated wood (with a non-metallic

preservative) was used for the cross beams. Steel helical piers, which are drilled down to bedrock (approximately 18 feet below ground surface), anchor the structure. After soil testing, the design engineer determined that two (2) additional steel helical piers were required to further stabilize the boardwalk. The two (2) additional piers are noted on the final boardwalk as-built drawing. Following construction, the "I-PILE Program" was re-run against International Building Code Requirements and confirmed that the boardwalk passed all lateral load requirements. In spite of meeting all code requirements, joists were blocked together using Simpson Joist Hangers as well as bolting a 2 x 6 to the 4 x 4 posts that hang down past the joists. This tied the right and left sides of the boardwalk together adding additional stability. (Design and as-built drawings are provided in Attachment D.)

- Signage – Two (2) permanent signs have been placed at the entrance. One generally describes the restored area and the other describes the historically significant 1876 train and bridge disaster. (The 1876 train and bridge disaster occurred at the bridge crossing which is currently located at the end of the natural walking trail.) Subsequently, a sculptured stone marker identifying "Indian Trails Park" was provided by the ATPC.
- Parking Area - The existing parking area was re-designed to provide for more vehicle spaces. This was achieved by changing the entrance to the parking lot from the side to the center. This modification encourages two (2) lines of parked cars. (Design drawings are provided in Attachment C.) During discussions with the City Engineer, it was determined that a new storm water catch basin would need to be installed since storm water collected at the point of the new entrance. A new entrance apron, catch basin, guard railings and a fresh layer of gravel provided a significant upgrade to the parking area.

#### **4.4 Current Conditions**

The planned primary and secondary restoration work were completed during the 2013 construction season (April through October). Project Field Reports can be found in Attachment E. Because of winter damage, re-planting of 95 trees and 177 bushes occurred in the spring of 2014 along with some minor repairs to the boardwalk and the natural pathways (Figure 4). The boardwalk experienced some static charge issues that were likely a result of the construction materials that were used. Installation of grounding wires along the boardwalk resolved this issue.

The primary restoration activities have enhanced and preserved the ecological conditions of the area. In addition, some carefully planned, synergistic human use service upgrades and additions have increased outdoor recreation opportunities for the people in Ashtabula and northeastern Ohio while protecting and preserving this high quality habitat.

The long-term operation and maintenance associated with the project is the obligation of the ATPC.

#### **4.5 Cost Summary**

The total cost of the ATPC restoration project was \$617,364. Following is a general breakdown of the costs for the primary and secondary restoration work at the ATPC Property:

- |  |           |
|--|-----------|
| • Survey Cost                              | \$1,305   |
| • Access Agreement, Mineral/Gas/Oil Leases | \$5,252   |
| • Restoration/Planning & Administration    | \$74,471  |
| • Restoration Implementation               | \$536,336 |

### **5.0 BUSH, CAYLOR, GUARRACINO, KIGHTLINGER & SHINER PROPERTIES**

#### **5.1 Acquisition & Transfer**

An element of the Consent Decree is the acquisition of certain properties within the Ashtabula River watershed. These properties were initially acquired by *de maximis* on behalf of the ARCG II. Consistent with the Consent Decree, the acquired properties were then transferred from *de maximis* to an “Acceptable Entity” identified by the Trustees. Following is a list of those properties and the date of acquisition by *de maximis*:

- Robert & Lallita Bush (“Bush Property”) – September 2009
- Richard & Eva Caylor (“Caylor Property”) – June 2007
- Mario & Patricia Guarracino (“Guarracino Property”) – November 2007
- Walter & Katherine Kightlinger (“Kightlinger Property”) – November 2008
- Allen & Alice Shiner (“Shiner Property”) – October 2009

Following is a list of the properties, the date of transfer from *de maximis* and the names of the “Acceptable Entities” identified by the Trustees to accept the properties:

- Bush Property transferred to Cleveland Museum of Natural History in December 2013
- Caylor Property transferred to ATPC in December 2013
- Guarracino Property transferred to ATPC in December 2013
- Kightlinger Property transferred to the Cleveland Museum of Natural History in December 2013
- Shiner Property transferred to the Cleveland Museum of Natural History in December 2013

Resources from the Ashtabula River natural resource damage settlement were used to acquire these properties. When transferred, the deeds for each of these properties included an Environmental Covenant as defined by Ohio Revised Code

5301.80 (D) and complies with Ohio Revised Code 5301.80 – 5301.92. All oil and gas leases have been removed from the chain of title for these properties.

## **5.2 Location & Description**

***The Bush Property*** is located at 5260 Arbor Drive in Kingsville Township, Ashtabula County, Ohio (Figure 5). The Bush Property's Zoning/Land Use is identified as "R-1 – Single family residential and agricultural uses".

The Bush Property is 33.73 acres in size and vacant of any structures. The north part of the property is a level, wooded plateau with a scenic setting overlooking a lower wooded area and the Ashtabula River. This part of the property slopes steeply to a lower, wooded plateau area and down further to the level of the Ashtabula River. The narrower middle part of the property is mostly steep, wooded hillside along the Ashtabula River. The southern part of the property has a large, level lower area as well as a steep wooded hillside. The southern part is particularly scenic - with the Hadlock Preserve on the opposite side of the River.

***The Caylor Property*** is located at the end of Diane Lane off East South Ridge Road in Ashtabula Township, Ashtabula County, Ohio (Figure 6). The Caylor Property's Zoning/Land Use is identified as "100 – Agricultural Vacant Land".

The Caylor Property is 17.005 acres (divided into 2 parcels) of vacant, wooded land. Located in the Ashtabula Gulf Area, the property is situated along the Ashtabula River with 1,350 feet of river frontage. There is a rich diversity of habitats and connectivity with no evidence of environmental impacts, development, utilities or infrastructure. Some soil disturbance caused by natural erosion and all-terrain vehicles has been observed. The floodplain portion of the site is located at the base of a steep escarpment that defines the river valley. A small – likely intermittent – stream enters the property at its northwestern corner. This stream appears to drain two large, off-site ponds above the escarpment. The stream cascades down the escarpment and spills onto the floodplain of the property (This is where a limited number of Ohio-classified invasive species have been identified.). The site contains a diversity of mature forested habitats with a closed canopy – 60 to 80 feet high – stretching from the escarpment to the edge of the Ashtabula River.

***The Guarracino Property*** is situated along the Ashtabula River with 1,500 feet of river frontage in the Ashtabula Gulf Area of Ashtabula Township – adjacent to Indian Trails and Cedarquist Parks (Figure 7). The Guarracino Property's Zoning/Land Use is identified as "300 – Industrial Vacant Land".

The property consists of 11.01 acres of vacant, wooded land with little evidence of human disturbance – except for some undeveloped footpaths likely used by anglers. The woods are dominated by Black Cherry, Ash and Black Gum trees along with very large specimens of Sycamore, Pin Oak and Cottonwood. Stands of invasive species (e.g. Japanese knotweed) have been observed in a number of locations.

*The Kightlinger Property* is located on the west side of State Line Road in the northeast part of Richmond Township, Ashtabula County, Ohio (Figure 8). Richmond Township is not zoned.

The Kightlinger Property consists of 101 acres of vacant, wooded land. The property is mostly rolling except in the north central area where there is a beaver pond/wetland area (approximately 2.5 acres). West of the beaver pond/wetland area, the land slopes to an upper ridge and then down to the south and west lower Ashtabula River level. At this point, the east branch of the Ashtabula River is a wide, fenn-type wetland with a shallow channel ranging in width from approximately 50 feet to 400 feet wide. A stream flows south and west from the beaver pond/wetland into the Ashtabula River. The property is mostly wooded (Red Maple, Aspen, Ash, White Oak, Red Oak, Hickory, Elm and Sugar Maple) except for two small cleared field areas (These areas may be the result of some selective timbering.). A natural trail system has been established throughout the property. An old, single grave (with a gravestone dated in the 1840's) is located in the southeast corner of the property.

*The Shiner Property* is located on the west side of State Line Road in the northeast part of Richmond Township, Ashtabula County, Ohio (Figure 9). Richmond Township is not zoned.

The Shiner Property is 38.2 acres (divided into 2 parcels) of vacant, wooded land. The property is mostly rolling except for a beaver pond/wetland and a flowing stream area. The property includes a stand of mature pine trees. A natural trail has been established through the property.

### **5.3 Restoration & Current Conditions**

The Bush, Caylor, Guarracino, Kightlinger and Shiner properties were evaluated for habitat and ecological qualities and found – except for some minor trash/debris cleanup - to have existing conditions that did not require any active restorative actions. The properties did, however, warrant long-term preservation measures (e.g., environmental covenants).

Following are some of the special habitat qualities and the current conditions associated with these properties:

- The Ashtabula River above the 2.0 river mile – to river mile 27.54 – is classified as superior high quality waters (Rule 3745-1-05, Ohio Administrative Code). Superior high quality waters is defined as surface waters that possess exceptional ecological values and that have been so categorized pursuant to Paragraph E of the aforementioned rule. The Bush, Caylor, Guarracino, Kightlinger and Shiner Properties are within this superior high quality reach.



- The Bush, Caylor and Guarracino Properties are within the Ashtabula River riparian ecosystem and connected by an extensive corridor of green space within or near the Indian Trails and Cedarquist Parks.
- Immediately offshore of the Caylor and Guarracino Properties the Ashtabula River exhibits a natural system of pools, riffles and flats that are ideal fish habitat.
- The Guarracino Property fills a critical gap in the park system and, thus, completes a continuous protected corridor of several miles, which provides a vital greenway for wildlife and affords excellent opportunities for access to the river for fishing and other recreational activities.
- The Guarracino Property contains some of the largest trees in the Ashtabula Gulf Area.
- The Caylor Property has old channels or former oxbows that run across the floodplain and retain water in a number of locations forming vernal pools which provide excellent habitat for ecologically important amphibians and other wildlife and plants.
- The Kightlinger Property contains a fenn-type wetland which provides special benefits to a watershed, including providing habitat for unique plant and animal communities.
- The Shiner Property is attractively wooded and close to Pymatuning State Park and very suitable for recreational use - including deer and waterfowl hunting.

#### 5.4 Cost Summary

Following is a breakdown of the acquisition costs associated with the Bush, Caylor, Guarracino, Kightlinger and Shiner Properties:

• Bush Property	\$193,047
• Caylor Property	\$71,523
• Guarracino Property	\$101,436
• Kightlinger Property	\$316,529
• Shiner Property	\$128,548

The total cost for the acquisition of these five (5) properties was \$811,083. This included the costs for acquisition, appraisals and surveys, restoration planning (including field inspections), closing expenses, forfeiture process for removal of

oil and gas leases and the preparation of conveyance documents (e.g., environmental covenants).

## **6.0 RICHARDSON PROPERTY**

### **6.1 Acquisition & Transfer**

An element of the Consent Decree is the possible acquisition of “Additional Restoration Properties”. Any such properties are to be initially acquired by *de maximis* on behalf of the ARCG II. Consistent with the Consent Decree, any “Additional Restoration Properties” will eventually be transferred from *de maximis* to an “Acceptable Entity” identified by the Trustees. One “Additional Restoration Property” was approved for acquisition by the Ashtabula Trustee Council on March 20, 2014 (Ashtabula Trustee Council Resolution #7). On April 30, 2015, approximately 141 acres of undeveloped property were acquired from the Richardson family by *de maximis*. The property is known as the “Richardson Property”.

Resources from the Ashtabula River natural resource damage settlement were used to acquire the Richardson Property. The Richardson Property was transferred from *de maximis* to the ATPC on February 19, 2016. The deed for this property included an Environmental Covenant as defined by Ohio Revised Code 5301.80 (D) and complies with Ohio Revised Code 5301.80 – 5301.92. All oil and gas leases have been removed from the chain of title for this property.

### **6.2 Location & Description**

*The Richardson Property* is situated on the north and south sides of Green Hill Road in Plymouth Township, Ashtabula County, Ohio (Figure 10) – approximately four (4) miles from downtown Ashtabula. The property is irregular in shape, with approximate frontages on the Ashtabula River of 2,700 feet on both the north and south sides of Green Hill Road. The Ashtabula River flows about 1.7 miles through and/or along the Richardson Property. The parcels of land that have structures (e.g., house) were not included in the acquisition.

### **6.3 Restoration & Current Conditions**

The Richardson Property was evaluated for habitat and ecological qualities and found by the Trustees to have existing conditions that warrant preservation and protection measures (e.g., environmental covenants) and no further restorative actions. The Richardson Property is uniquely scenic with the Ashtabula River meandering through heavily wooded areas. The trees consist of mature maple and poplar with oaks and some black cherry near the River. The Richardson Property provides habitat for a number of valuable species (e.g., Vernal water starwort (*Callitriche palustris*) and the Bombardier beetle (*Carabidae sp.*))



**6.4 Cost Summary**

The cost of the Richardson Property was \$582,185. This included the costs for acquisition, appraisal and survey, restoration planning, closing expenses, forfeiture process for removal of oil and gas leases and preparation of conveyance documents (e.g., environmental covenant).

**7.0 FINAL STATEMENT OF COMPLETION OF WORK**


All work was performed in accordance with approved work plans and/or Trustee resolutions or directives. The work is described in this report – “The Restoration Completion Report”.


**8.0 FINAL STATEMENT OF “QUALIFIED COSTS”**

A summary of Qualified Costs has been provided in Sections 4.5, 5.4, and 6.4 of this document. The total cost to complete the three (3) elements of the settlement (Section 2.0) was \$2,010,632. Attachment F contains the “Final Detailed Statement of Qualified Costs”.

**9.0 PROJECT COORDINATOR’S STATEMENT**

“To the best of my knowledge, after thorough investigation, I certify that the information contained in or accompanying this submission is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations.”

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Joseph A. Heimbuch, Project Coordinator  
*de maximis, inc.*

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date